

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN**  
**SOUTHERN DIVISION**

*In Re Flint Water Cases,*

No. 5:16-cv-10444-JEL-MKM

Hon. Judith E. Levy

Mag. Mona K. Majzoub

**CHAPMAN PLAINTIFFS' RESPONSE TO ORDER OF COURT**  
**DATED APRIL 28, 2020, DKT #1718**

- 1) See Motion to File Under Seal filed April 28, 2021 at Dkt. # 1719.
- 2) a) See attached emails from Valdemar Washington, Esquire dated March 9 and March 10 , 2021 Exs. A and B.

The March 10 email documents the facts that

- When Defendant VNA filed Daubert challenges to the Class Plaintiffs' experts, the challenges relied in part on the deposition of Dr. Specht
- As a result, on Feb. 4, 2021, Class Counsel asked Mr. Stern to release Dr. Specht's transcript to them, subject to the overall protective order, ECF # 1162-3
- In response to this request, Mr. Stern replied "Yes. Absolutely."
- Shortly thereafter, VNA's counsel emailed copies of Dr. Specht's transcript to seven other plaintiffs' attorneys. These were "produced without redaction"

as per my conversation with Corey this afternoon, and should be maintained as Highly Confidential”

Ex. B attached

Under paragraph 12 (b) (iv) of the Confidentiality Order, all counsel of record for parties in the federal Flint Water Cases” are entitled to access material labeled “Highly Confidential.” Moreover, such material may be used by “any party” at trial or any evidentiary hearing. *Id.* at para. 11 (c). Since the undersigned is counsel of record for parties in the Flint Water Cases, he is entitled to access the material and use it under the terms of the order.

Paragraph 10 of the Confidentiality Order further allows Highly Confidential documents to be filed under seal in accordance with Local Rule 5.3. Undersigned counsel followed the protocol required by Local Rule 5.3. Originally the Motion to Seal was filed by hardcopy only, and was received by the court on Monday April 26. See Fed Ex tracking slip attached as Ex. C.

After receipt of this court’s order, the same document was electronically filed on April 28, 2021 as Dkt.# 1719.

b) The only “sharing” of these materials was that counsel were sent pages 46-48 and 138-140 of the deposition, plus the list of exhibits, as required by Local Rule 5.3. See Ex. D attached email from Pam Keys.

These pages contained no information whatsoever about any child, or any child’s medical condition. They only contained information about the total number

of bone scans performed through the date of the deposition, the amount of time it took Dr. Specht to review four bone scans, and his hourly rate, all of which are relevant to the overall fairness of the settlement and attorneys' fees and expenses being sought by Liaison Counsel.

c) No copies were made.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Mark R. Cuker  
MARK. R. CUKER

# Exhibit “A”

**From:** Valdemar Washington <val@vlwlegal.com>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 9, 2021 2:25 PM  
**To:** Mark Cuker <mark@cukerlaw.com>  
**Cc:** Stephen Monroe <smonroe@bernlpp.com>; Atty. Gladys L. Christopherson <gladys@vlwlegal.com>  
**Subject:** Re: Flint - Cuker Law bone scans (2021.02.21)

Michael Pitt - however, the transcript itself is marked “Highly Confidential” which means that if you are planning to use it as a part of a filing with the Court there are certain procedures that you have to follow

On Mar 9, 2021, at 2:22 PM, Mark Cuker <[mark@cukerlaw.com](mailto:mark@cukerlaw.com)> wrote:

Who told you that

Sent from my iPhone

On Mar 9, 2021, at 1:50 PM, Valdemar Washington <[val@vlwlegal.com](mailto:val@vlwlegal.com)> wrote:

Hi Mark,

I have been told that there is no protective order on these deposition transcripts.

Val

<2020.10.16 Specht, Aaron Final Depo Transcript Day 2 (1).pdf>  
<2020.10.15 Specht, Aaron Final Depo Transcript Day 1.pdf>

# Exhibit ‘‘B’’

**From:** Valdemar Washington <[val@vlwlegal.com](mailto:val@vlwlegal.com)>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 10, 2021 2:54 PM  
**To:** Marc Bern <[mberns@bernlpp.com](mailto:mberns@bernlpp.com)>; Stephen Monroe <[smonroe@bernlpp.com](mailto:smonroe@bernlpp.com)>; Mark Cuker <[mark@cukerlaw.com](mailto:mark@cukerlaw.com)>; Joseph J. Cappelli <[jcappelli@bernlpp.com](mailto:jcappelli@bernlpp.com)>  
**Subject:** Fwd: Flint: Dr. Thompson File Materials/Bellwether Plaintiffs

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** Michael Pitt <[mpitt@pittlawpc.com](mailto:mpitt@pittlawpc.com)>  
**Subject: FW: Flint: Dr. Thompson File Materials/Bellwether Plaintiffs**  
**Date:** March 10, 2021 at 2:29:58 PM EST  
**To:** Valdemar Washington <[val@vlwlegal.com](mailto:val@vlwlegal.com)>

Val: This is the email chain explaining how we got access to the Specht Transcript

**From:** Devine, Alaina N. <[ADevine@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:ADevine@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 4, 2021 2:44 PM  
**To:** Theodore Leopold <[tleopold@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:tleopold@cohenmilstein.com)>; [CStorn@levylaw.com](mailto:CStorn@levylaw.com)  
**Cc:** Hunter Shkolnik ([hunter@napolilaw.com](mailto:hunter@napolilaw.com)) <[huner@napolilaw.com](mailto:hunter@napolilaw.com)>; Esther Berezofsky <[EBerezofsky@eblawllc.com](mailto:EBerezofsky@eblawllc.com)>; [pnovak@weitzlux.com](mailto:pnovak@weitzlux.com); Emmy Levens <[elevens@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:elevens@cohenmilstein.com)>; Jessica Weiner <[jweiner@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:jweiner@cohenmilstein.com)>; Michael Pitt <[mpitt@pittlawpc.com](mailto:mpitt@pittlawpc.com)>; Campbell, James M. <[jmcampbell@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:jmcampbell@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>; Rogers, David M. <[drogers@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:drogers@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>; Penhallegon, John R. <[jpenhallegon@campbelltriallawyers.com](mailto:jpenhallegon@campbelltriallawyers.com)>; Fletcher, Christopher D.

<[CFletcher@campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:CFletcher@campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>

**Subject:** RE: Flint: Dr. Thompson File Materials/Bellwether Plaintiffs

Ted,

Per Corey's note, attached are the transcripts for Specht and Krishnan. These are being produced without redaction per my conversation with Corey this afternoon, and should be maintained as Highly Confidential.

Thank you,

*Alaina N. Devine*

**Campbell Conroy & O'Neil  
Professional Corporation**

<image001.jpg>

One Constitution Wharf

Suite 310

Boston, MA 02129

Tel: (617) 241-3037

Fax: (617) 241-5115

Email: [adevine@campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:adevine@campbell-trial-lawyers.com)

**Note :** This e-mail contains information from the law firm of Campbell Conroy & O'Neil Professional Corporation that may be proprietary, confidential, or protected under the attorney-client privilege or work-product doctrine. This e-mail is intended for the use only of the named recipient. If you are not the intended recipient named above, you are strictly prohibited from reading, disclosing, copying, or distributing this e-mail or its contents, and from taking any action in reliance on the contents of this e-mail. If you received this e-mail in error, please delete this message and respond immediately by e-mail to the author or call (617) 241-3000.

**From:** Devine, Alaina N.

**Sent:** Thursday, February 4, 2021 1:47 PM

**To:** Theodore Leopold <[tleopold@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:tleopold@cohenmilstein.com)>; [CStern@levylaw.com](mailto:CStern@levylaw.com)

**Cc:** Hunter Shkolnik ([hunter@napolilaw.com](mailto:hunter@napolilaw.com)) <[hunter@napolilaw.com](mailto:hunter@napolilaw.com)>; Esther

Berezofsky <[EBerezofsky@eblawllc.com](mailto:EBerezofsky@eblawllc.com)>; [pnovak@weitzlux.com](mailto:pnovak@weitzlux.com); Emmy

Levens <[elevens@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:elevens@cohenmilstein.com)>; Jessica Weiner

<[jweiner@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:jweiner@cohenmilstein.com)>; mpitt <[mpitt@pittlawpc.com](mailto:mpitt@pittlawpc.com)>; Campbell, James

M. <[jmcampbell@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:jmcampbell@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>; Rogers, David M.

<[drogers@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:drogers@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>; Penhallegon, John R.

<[jpenhallegon@campbelltriallawyers.com](mailto:jpenhallegon@campbelltriallawyers.com)>; Fletcher, Christopher D.

<[CFletcher@campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:CFletcher@campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>

**Subject:** Flint: Dr. Thompson File Materials/Bellwether Plaintiffs

Ted,

Per Corey's note, we will put the materials on a Sharefile site now and have that along to you shortly.

Thank you,

*Alaina N. Devine*

**Campbell Conroy & O'Neil**

**Professional Corporation**

One Constitution Wharf

Suite 310

Boston, MA 02129

Tel: (617) 241-3037

Fax: (617) 241-5115

Email: [adevine@campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:adevine@campbell-trial-lawyers.com)

**Note** : This e-mail contains information from the law firm of Campbell Conroy & O'Neil Professional Corporation that may be proprietary, confidential, or protected under the attorney- client privilege or work-product doctrine. This e-mail is intended for the use only of the named recipient. If you are not the intended recipient named above, you are strictly prohibited from reading, disclosing, copying, or distributing this e-mail or its contents, and from taking any action in reliance on the contents of this e-mail. If you received this e-mail in error, please delete this message and respond immediately by e-mail to the author or call (617) 241-3000.

**From:** Theodore Leopold <[tleopold@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:tleopold@cohenmilstein.com)>

**Sent:** Thursday, February 4, 2021 1:00 PM

**To:** Stern, Corey <[CStern@levylaw.com](mailto:CStern@levylaw.com)>

**Cc:** Hunter Shkolnik ([hunter@napolilaw.com](mailto:hunter@napolilaw.com)) <[hunter@napolilaw.com](mailto:hunter@napolilaw.com)>; Devine, Alaina N. <[ADevine@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:ADevine@Campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>; Esther Berezofsky <[EBerezofsky@eblawllc.com](mailto:EBerezofsky@eblawllc.com)>; [pnovak@weitzlux.com](mailto:pnovak@weitzlux.com); Emmy Levens <[elevens@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:elevens@cohenmilstein.com)>; Jessica Weiner <[jweiner@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:jweiner@cohenmilstein.com)>; mpitt <[mpitt@pittlawpc.com](mailto:mpitt@pittlawpc.com)>

**Subject:** RE: Flint

Alaina,

See Corey's response below. Does this cure your objection and thus you will immediately provide the materials?

Ted

**Theodore Leopold**

Partner

<image004.jpg>

**Cohen Milstein Sellers & Toll PLLC**

11780 U.S. Highway One | Suite N500  
Palm Beach Gardens, FL 33408

phone 561.515.1400  
fax 561.515.1401

[website](#)

**Powerful Advocates. Meaningful Results.**

*This e-mail was sent from Cohen Milstein Sellers & Toll PLLC. It may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you suspect that you were not intended to receive it, please delete it and notify us as soon as possible.*

**From:** Stern, Corey <[CStern@levylaw.com](mailto:CStern@levylaw.com)>

**Sent:** Thursday, February 4, 2021 12:57 PM

**To:** Theodore Leopold <[tleopold@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:tleopold@cohenmilstein.com)>

**Cc:** Hunter Shkolnik ([hunter@napolilaw.com](mailto:hunter@napolilaw.com)) <[hunter@napolilaw.com](mailto:hunter@napolilaw.com)>; Devine, Alaina N. <[ADevine@campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:ADevine@campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>; Esther Berezofsky <[EBerezofsky@eblawllc.com](mailto:EBerezofsky@eblawllc.com)>; [pnovak@weitzlux.com](mailto:pnovak@weitzlux.com); Emmy Levens <[elevens@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:elevens@cohenmilstein.com)>; Jessica Weiner <[jweiner@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:jweiner@cohenmilstein.com)>; mpitt <[mpitt@pittlawpc.com](mailto:mpitt@pittlawpc.com)>

**Subject:** Re: Flint

Yes. Absolutely.

Corey M. Stern

Levy Konigsberg, LLP

800 Third Ave, 11th Floor

New York, New York 10022

(212)605-6298

(212)605-6290 (facsimile)

<https://link.edgepilot.com/s/8632bf13/kv4al7dirUWvrgCodA5Wnw?u=http://www.levylaw.com/>

On Feb 4, 2021, at 12:54 PM, Theodore Leopold <[tleopold@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:tleopold@cohenmilstein.com)> wrote:

Hunter and Corey

As you know VNA filed Daubert challenges to everyone of our experts. One of their supporting declarations in support of one of their Daubert Motions is that of Dr. David Thompson. Dr. Thompson's deposition is set for Feb. 10-11. Within Dr. Thompson's file is Dr. Specht's and Mira Krishnar's deposition transcripts. Per Dr. Thompson's supporting declaration he relies on both depositions in support of opinions. VNA has refused to provide the two deposition transcripts to us on the grounds of Judge Levy's earlier ruling with was based upon your objections. It seems we are in a catch 22. Will you agree to allow VNA to provide the two transcripts to us asap under a protective order? If not, I need to immediately raise the issue with Judge Levy. Please let me know asap.

Ted

**Theodore Leopold**

Partner

[<image001.jpg>](#)

**Cohen Milstein Sellers & Toll PLLC**

11780 U.S. Highway One | Suite N500  
Palm Beach Gardens, FL 33408

phone 561.515.1400  
fax 561.515.1401

[website](#) | [map](#)

**Powerful Advocates. Meaningful Results.**

*This e-mail was sent from Cohen Milstein Sellers & Toll PLLC. It may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you suspect that you were not intended to receive it, please delete it and notify us as soon as possible.*

**CONFIDENTIALITY STATEMENT** This e-mail transmission and any accompanying attachment contains information that is confidential, privileged and exempt from disclosure under applicable law. This e-mail is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed. If you receive this e-mail in error or you are not the intended recipient, do not read, copy or disseminate in any manner. If you are not the intended recipient, you may not disseminate, distribute or copy this communication and any disclosure, copying, distribution, use or taking any action in reliance on the contents of this information is strictly prohibited. If you received this communication in error, please reply to the message immediately by informing the sender that the message was misdirected and after advising the sender you must erase the message from your computer system and destroy any hard copies that may have been made. Thank you for your assistance in correcting this error.

---

This email has been scanned for spam and viruses. Click [here](#) to report this email as spam.

Links contained in this email have been replaced. If you click on a link in the email above, the link will be analyzed for known threats. If a known threat is found, you will not be able to proceed to the destination. If suspicious content is detected, you will see a warning.

<2020.10.05 Krishnan, Mira Final Depo Transcript Volume I.pdf>

<2020.10.06 Krishnan, Mira Final Depo Transcript Volume II.pdf>

<2020.10.15 Specht, Aaron Final Depo Transcript Day 1.pdf>

<2020.10.16 Specht, Aaron Final Depo Transcript Day 2.pdf>

Thank you,

**Valdemar L. Washington** | Attorney at Law  
**Valdemar L. Washington, PLLC**



📞 [\(810\) 407-6868](tel:(810)407-6868)  
📠 [\(810\) 691-2002](tel:(810)691-2002)  
📅 [\(810\) 265-7315](tel:(810)265-7315)  
✉️ [Val@VLWLegal.com](mailto:Val@VLWLegal.com)  
📍 [P.O. Box 187, Flint, MI 48501](http://P.O. Box 187, Flint, MI 48501)

---

This email and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this email in error please notify the system manager. This message contains confidential information and is intended only for the individual named. If you are not the named addressee you should not disseminate, distribute or copy this e-mail. Please notify the sender immediately by e-mail if you have received this e-mail by mistake and delete this e-mail from your system. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that disclosing, copying, distributing or taking any action in reliance on the contents of this information is strictly prohibited.

# Exhibit “C”



773539779674

[ADD NICKNAME](#)

Delivered

Monday, April 26, 2021 at 10:02 am

**DELIVERED**

Signed for by: J.STRONG

[GET STATUS UPDATES](#)[OBTAIN PROOF OF DELIVERY](#)**FROM**

Cuker Law Firm  
Mark R. Cuker  
One Logan Square  
130 N. 18th Street, Suite 1200  
Philadelphia, PA US 19103  
215-531-8522

**TO**

Federal Building and US Courthouse  
District Court EDMI  
600 Church Street  
Room 140  
FLINT, MI US 48502  
215-531-8522

## Travel History

**TIME ZONE**

Local Scan Time



Monday, April 26, 2021

10:02 AM

FLINT, MI

Delivered

8:11 AM

FLINT, MI

On FedEx vehicle for delivery

6:35 AM FLINT, MI At local FedEx facility

4:51 AM FLINT, MI At destination sort facility

Sunday, April 25, 2021

5:49 PM MEMPHIS, TN Departed FedEx location

Saturday, April 24, 2021

6:09 PM FORT WASHINGTON, PA Left FedEx origin facility

3:04 PM FORT WASHINGTON, PA Picked up

1:27 PM JENKINTOWN, PA Picked up  
Tendered at FedEx Office

11:27 AM Shipment information sent to FedEx

## Shipment Facts

TRACKING NUMBER	SERVICE	WEIGHT
773539779674	FedEx Standard Overnight	1 lbs / 0.45 kgs
DELIVERY ATTEMPTS	DELIVERED TO	TOTAL PIECES
1	Guard/Security Station	1
TOTAL SHIPMENT WEIGHT	TERMS	PACKAGING
1 lbs / 0.45 kgs	Shipper	FedEx Envelope
SPECIAL HANDLING SECTION	SHIP DATE	STANDARD TRANSIT
Deliver Weekday, Saturday Pickup	4/24/21 <a href="#">?</a>	4/26/21 by 4:30 pm <a href="#">?</a>
ACTUAL DELIVERY		
4/26/21 at 10:02 am		

# Exhibit “D”

**From:** Pam Keys

**Sent:** Monday, April 26, 2021 9:18 AM

**To:** [PErickson@plunkettcooney.com](mailto:PErickson@plunkettcooney.com); [wayne.mason@faegredrinker.com](mailto:wayne.mason@faegredrinker.com); Devine, Alaina N. <[ADevine@campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:ADevine@campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>; Campbell, James M. <[jmcampbell@campbell-trial-lawyers.com](mailto:jmcampbell@campbell-trial-lawyers.com)>; [cbarbieri@fosterswift.com](mailto:cbarbieri@fosterswift.com); [kuhlr@michigan.gov](mailto:kuhlr@michigan.gov); [wkim@cityofflint.com](mailto:wkim@cityofflint.com); Craig S. Thompson <[cthompson@sullivanwardlaw.com](mailto:cthompson@sullivanwardlaw.com)>; [ssmith@bdlaw.com](mailto:ssmith@bdlaw.com); Hunter Shkolnik <[Hunter@napolilaw.com](mailto:Hunter@napolilaw.com)>; [tleopold@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:tleopold@cohenmilstein.com); Jayson Blake <[jeblake@mcalpinelawfirm.com](mailto:jeblake@mcalpinelawfirm.com)>; [mpitt@pittlawpc.com](mailto:mpitt@pittlawpc.com); [Michael.L.Williams@usdoj.gov](mailto:Michael.L.Williams@usdoj.gov); [LJensen@hallrender.com](mailto:LJensen@hallrender.com); [bettenhausenm@michigan.gov](mailto:bettenhausenm@michigan.gov); Mark Cuker <[mark@cukerlaw.com](mailto:mark@cukerlaw.com)>; [smonroe@bernlpp.com](mailto:smonroe@bernlpp.com); [DGreenspan@blankrome.com](mailto:DGreenspan@blankrome.com); [CStorn@levylaw.com](mailto:CStorn@levylaw.com); [frank.bednarz@hlli.org](mailto:frank.bednarz@hlli.org)

**Cc:** Mark Cuker <[mark@cukerlaw.com](mailto:mark@cukerlaw.com)>

**Subject:** Flint Water Litigation

Attached please find an unredacted version of Chapman Plaintiffs' Motion to Review and Respond to Hourly Billing and costs; and for Discovery of Bone Scan Information, and Exhibit C to the Declaration of Mark R. Cuker which has been conditionally filed under seal, as well as Chapman Plaintiffs' Motion to file these documents under seal.

PAMELA KEYS

Paralegal

Cuker Law Firm

[pam@cukerlaw.com](mailto:pam@cukerlaw.com)

215.531.8522

[www.cukerlaw.com](http://www.cukerlaw.com)